

Academic Peer Review Form

Submission Name: _____ Reviewer Alias: _____

Directions: For all questions, circle a number; one denotes the lowest or worst possible score.

1 2 3
Poor, weak logic

4 5 6 7
Mediocre

8 9 10
Excellent, sound logic

I. Argument (40%)

Does the essay appear to test, create, or extend a new theory or argument in a meaningful way? 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

Does the essay appear to inform or improve our understanding of a prior theory or argument? 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

Are the major concepts clearly defined? 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

How effective is the logic of the argument? 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

Comments:

II. Contribution (20%)

Does this essay appear to pose a meaningful, interesting, and/or important contribution to the field/subject? 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

Do the essay's findings appear to make a difference? 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

Comments:

III. Rhetorical Devices (18%)

How well defined is the essay's focus? 1 2 3 4 5 6

How well defined is the essay's audience? 1 2 3 4 5 6

How well does the essay use the conventions of structure and format to adapt to the rhetorical situation? 1 2 3 4 5 6

Comments:

IV. Use of Supporting Sources (14%)

How well does the essay synthesize appropriate sources to support the thesis? 1 2 3 4 5 6

Does the essay appear to appropriately cite sources? 1 2 3 4

Do the sources appear to be valid and reliable? 1 2 3 4

Comments:

V. Grammar and Mechanics (8%)

How well does this essay adhere to standard English (i.e. complete sentences, correct spelling, punctuation, and word choice)? 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8

Total Score: /100

1. What recommendations would you make to strengthen this essay?

2. Recommendation (circle one): **PUBLISH** **DON'T PUBLISH** **MAYBE**